

To: ALA/ALCTS/CCS Committee on Cataloging: Description and Access

From: Task Force on FRBR Terminology

Re: 4JSC/Chair/76/Chair follow-up/4/Sec follow-up/LC response, section #5

At the request of the chair of CC:DA, the Task Force on FRBR Terminology offers these comments on 4JSC/Chair/76/Chair follow-up/4/Sec follow-up/LC response. Per 4JSC/M/572.10, comments will be restricted to #5 on LC concerns about use of “format,” “formats,” “materials,” “types of material,” “class of material,” “distinct” vs. “different.”

General comments: The Task Force has only commented on “materials,” “types of material,” “class of material” in CC:DA /TF/FRBR Terminology/5:

ALA response supported LC’s restriction of the use of the term “material” to the distinction between published and unpublished material. Note that this applies only where the term “material” (singular) alone is used. “Class of materials”/“Class of material” continues to be used but is sometimes shortened to “materials” (plural). Where “material” (singular) alone was used in the rules in the class of materials sense, *Sec follow-up* generally inserts a qualifying “class of” so the usage will not be confused with “material” in the published/unpublished sense. The Task Force does not object to use of “material” in the “class of materials” sense but the plural/singular distinction (if intended) may be too subtle.

LC in 4JSC/LC/60 proposes revising the definition of “format” to:

Format. In its widest sense, a particular physical presentation of a manifestation bibliographic resource ~~an item~~.

For reference purposes, the definition in LC/60 for “physical carrier”:

Physical carrier. A physical medium in which data, sound, images, etc., are stored. For certain categories of material, the physical carrier consists of a storage medium (e.g., tape, film) sometimes encased in a plastic, metal, etc., housing (e.g., cassette, cartridge) that is an integral part of the manifestation bibliographic resource ~~item~~. *See also* Container.

Remark: Revised to replace “bibliographic resource” with “manifestation” because physical carrier is related to manifestation [no previous comments on this definition in 4JSC/Chair/76/Chair follow-up/4]

LC’s recommendations under bullet 5 to prefer “physical carrier” to “format” do not seem intuitively obvious. The current definitions, even in revised form, appear to use “format” in the broader sense, with “physical carrier” associated with non-print media. If JSC agrees to use “physical carrier,” the TF believes that the definition for “physical carrier” needs to make it clear that printed material is also within scope.

Comments on specific rules:

4JSC/Chair/76/Chair follow-up/4/Sec follow-up version:

1.1C3. If the bibliographic resource item is a reproduction in one format material of a work originally presented in another format material (e.g., a text as microform; a map on a slide), give the general material designation appropriate to the format material being described (e.g., in the case of a map on a slide, give the designation appropriate to the slide).

LC recommends using “physical carrier” instead of “format” (in parentheses, “microform” would then need to be changed to “microfilm”)

The original TF response re 1.1C3 did not comment on the “format” term, but did note that “manifestation” might be preferable to “bibliographic resource.” LC’s recommendation of “physical carrier” would not be in conflict, since LC/60 revises the definition of “physical carrier” by replacing “bibliographic resource” with “manifestation.” However, note that the “format” definition revision also replaces “bibliographic resource” with “manifestation.” Use of either term would be consistent with TF preference for “manifestation.” Pending further clarification from LC, TF would recommend continuing to use “format.”

1.1C4. If a bibliographic resource an item contains parts belonging to materials falling into two or more categories in the list chosen and if none of these is the predominant constituent of the bibliographic resource item, give multimedia or kit (see 1.1C1 and 1.10C1).

LC recommends deleting “belonging to materials” or replacing those words with “belonging to physical carriers” (also need to add “physical” preceding “parts” in first line)

As indicated above, while ALA/TF supported LC’s recommendation limiting use of “material” in the narrow sense to published/unpublished situations, the TF also states that “material” in the “class of materials” sense is still justified in the appropriate context, but there is some concern that the distinction may be too subtle.

LC’s strategy seems to be to replace “materials” in the “class of materials” sense with “physical carriers” when possible to reduce ambiguity.

Since LC continues to use “material” in the “class of materials” sense in its proposed revision to the definition of Physical Carrier (see above, although why not “classes of material” rather than “categories of material?”), and since LC does not propose replacing “class of materials” in its proposed revisions to 1.10C2a-b, it doesn’t appear that LC is jettisoning the “class of materials” term.

If so, the LC recommendations clarify potential ambiguities noted in the TF response but do not appear to be proposing ultimately the elimination of the term “class of materials.”

The TF therefore recommends that ALA endorse the changes, but that we continue to support use of the “class of materials” term and concept where appropriate. Editorial note: *multimedia* and *kit* are italicized in the original rule.

1.5A3. If manifestations of a work are an item is available in different formats (e.g., as text and microfilm; as sound disc and sound tape reel), give the physical description of the format in hand. Optionally, make a note describing other formats ~~in~~ which are it is available (see 1.7B16).

See general comment and comment at 1.1C3 re “format.” Editorial note: “which” should now be “that” in the last sentence.

1.7B16. Manifestations in other ~~Other~~ formats. Give the details of other formats in which the content of the bibliographic resource item has been issued.

~~For details of other formats available in the library, see 1.7B20.~~

See general comment and comment at 1.1C3 re “format.”

1.10. Bibliographic Resources Items Made Up of Several Types of Material

See comment on 1.1C4 re “material.” Consider using “Distinct Material Types” to be consistent with the text of 1.10A?

1.10A. This rule applies to bibliographic resources items that are made up of two or more components, two or more of which belong to distinct material types (e.g., a sound recording and a printed text).

See comment on 1.1C4 re “material.” LC’s recommendation replacing “sound recording” by “sound cassette” would be consistent with the more specific use of “physical carrier.”

1.10C2. Physical description. Apply whichever of the following three methods is appropriate to the bibliographic resource item being described:

- a) Give the extent of each part or group of parts belonging to each distinct class of material as the first element of the physical description (do this if no further physical description of each part item is desired). Optionally, if the parts are in a container, name the container and give its dimensions.
- b) Give a separate physical description for each part or group of parts belonging to each distinct class of material (do this if a further physical description of each part item is desired). Give each physical description on a separate line. Optionally, if the parts are in a container, name the container after the last physical description and give its dimensions.

1.10C2a-b appear to have something to do with LC’s concern about the use of “distinct” vs. “different.” The cause for concern is not explained, and the TF is uncertain why “distinct” needs to be added.