

TO: Kristin Lindlan, Chair,
ALCTS CCS Committee on Cataloging: Description and Access

FR: Kate Harcourt, Columbia University

RE: Proposed New Revision of AACR2 rule 21.30J1

BACKGROUND INFORMATION AND NEW PROPOSAL

4JSC/ALA/35 proposed revising AACR2 rule 21.30J1 to say to make an added entry under title proper of every item entered under personal, corporate or uniform title heading and discontinue not making the title added entry in four exception categories. Reasons behind the change were that the rule is a carry over from card catalog days where different types of entries were interfiled and there was a tendency to be more conservative in generating access points. Properly applying and maintaining these exceptions in an online environment is becoming increasingly cumbersome. Likewise, their usefulness is increasingly diminishing as fewer and fewer libraries file cards. The vast majority of online systems index all titles regardless of the indicator value coded in 245 and many automated processes can not easily maintain the integrity of indicator values.

CC:DA voted on January 15, 2001 to change 21.30J1 as proposed but voted in addition to include an optional provision to the rule which would allow an institution to continue not to make added entries for the four exception categories.

In September 2001, the Canadian Committee on Cataloging informed the JSC that it did not support the proposal to make the categories in paragraph one optional (4JSC/ALA/35/CCC response). The JSC, at its October 2001 meeting, withdrew both ALA/35 (except for separating out the final paragraph as 20.30J2), and the related proposal to revise AACR2 rule 25.2.2E1 (4JSC/ALA39)

CC:DA, however, believes that the proposal continues to have merit. CCC objections include that it is “not logical to make entries for a title proper composed by a cataloguer” and that the online processing of indicator values should not influence rule revision. Cataloger composed titles, however, appear on books spines and are cited in bibliographies and become known to readers. Machine processing is becoming more and more common and many libraries do not even see the records purchased from vendors. Applying the exception categories has become too costly and labor intensive for many libraries. It may be that the rule, rewritten, as it was to please all constituents, became so complicated with options that the fundamental concept of rule simplification was obscured. A solution may be to more radically rework the rule to simply state that added entries should be made in all situations. Local cataloging agencies could then write their own rule interpretations to meet local needs.

CURRENT RULE WITH PROPOSED CHANGES (Current text of 21.30J2 from forthcoming Amendments 2002)

21.30J. Titles

21.30J1. Title proper. Make an added entry under the title proper of every item entered under a personal heading, a corporate heading, or a uniform title, ~~unless:~~

- ~~— a) the title proper is essentially the same as the main entry heading or a reference to that heading~~
- ~~or b) the title proper has been composed by the cataloguer~~
- ~~or c) in a catalogue in which name-title and subject entries are interfiled, the title proper is identical to a subject heading assigned to the work or a direct reference to that subject heading~~
- ~~or d) a conventionalized uniform title has been used as the uniform title for a musical work (see 25.25–25.35).~~

~~If considered necessary for access, make an added entry in the following situations:~~

- ~~— a) for any change in the title proper of a serial that is not a major change (see 21.2A2)~~
- ~~— b) for the title proper of an earlier iteration of an integrating resource (see 21.2C)~~
- ~~— c) for the earlier/later title proper of a multipart item (see 21.2B2).~~

21.30J2. Variant title. If considered necessary for access, make an added entry for any version of the title (e.g., cover title, caption title, running title, panel title, title on container, title bar title) that is significantly different from the title proper.

CLEAN COPY OF REVISED RULE

21.30J. Titles

21.30J1. Title proper. Make an added entry under the title proper of every item entered under a personal heading, a corporate heading, or a uniform title.

21.30J2. Variant title. If considered necessary for access, make an added entry for any version of the title (e.g., cover title, caption title, running title, panel title, title on container, title bar title) that is significantly different from the title proper.