

To: ALA/ALCTS/CCS Committee on Cataloging: Description and Access

From: Task Force on Consistency Across Part I of AACR2
Prepared by Peter Fletcher and Nancy Lorimer

Subject: Area 3, Material Specific Details Area: Analysis

General

We have used a similar analysis document to that prepared for Area 2. It is presented in sections: A) the unique rule(s) in Chapter 1; B) Unique rules in chapters 2-12; C) Similarities/Inconsistencies across Chapters 2-12.

A. Unique rules in Chapter 1

The Part of **1.3A** that does not deal with punctuation is the only unique rule in Chapter 1. John Attig pointed out that 0.25 is a more comprehensive general instruction for Area 3 and that perhaps we might want to consider recommending moving that rule to 1.3. Part of 0.25 is repeated in 1.3A, but more instruction is given in 0.25. Also, the text of the rule 0.25 seems more appropriate in 1.3A. than buried in an introductory section.

Recommendation: move the text of the rule in 0.25 to 1.3A, eliminating 0.25.

B. Unique rules in Chapters 2-12

[*Note:* rules X.3A1 and 12.3A2 dealing with punctuation are mostly unique to each chapter, with similarities dealt with in section C]

Chapter 3

(Mathematical Data and Other Material Specific Details Area)

- ✓ **3.3A1, 3.3A2, 3.3A3, 3.3B1, 3.3B2, 3.3B3, 3.3B4, 3.3B5, 3.3B6, 3.3B7, 3.3C1, 3.3C2, 3.3D1, 3.3D2, 3.3E1, 3.3F1, 3.3G1.** These rules deal with Punctuation, Statement of scale, Statement of projection, Statement of coordinates and equinox. *Except:*
- ✓ **3.3A2** requires the use of English
- ✓ **3.3A3** indicates the order of different types of Material Specific Details areas when present
- ✓ **3.3F1** deals with Digital graphic representation.

Chapter 5

- ✓ **5.3A1, 5.3B1, 5.3B2** (Musical presentation statement)

Chapter 9

(Type and Extent of Resource Area)

- ✓ **9.3A1** Punctuation
- ✓ **9.3B1** Type of resource
- ✓ **9.3B2** Extent of resource

Chapter 11

(Specific Data for Cartographic Materials, Music, and Serials)

- ✓ **11.3A1** refers to 3.3 Mathematical data area
- ✓ **11.3B1** refers to 5.3 Physical presentation of music
- ✓ **11.3C1** refers to 12.3 Numeric ... or other designation

Chapter 12

(Numbering Area)

- ✓ **12.3A1** refers to material that is applicable (serials v. integrating resources)
- ✓ **12.3B1, 12.3B2, 12.3C1, 12.3C2, 12.3C3, 12.3C4, 12.3D1, 12.3E1, 12.3E,**
12.3F1, 12.G1 refer to numeric ... chronological designations

C. Similarities/Inconsistencies across chapters**Applicability:**

- ✓ **2.3A, 4.3A, 6.3A, 7.3A, 8.3A, 10.3A** all have a statement indicating the area isn't used in that given chapter. Probably this is necessary, even though the chapters in which Area 3 is used is mentioned in the present Chapter 1 rule (**1.3A**). Having the same statement in each of these chapters doesn't require the cataloger to verify each rule with its corresponding rule in chapter 1.
- ✓ **12.3A1** indicates that this area applies to serials and generally not to integrating resources.

Recommendation A: None**Punctuation:**

- ✓ **3.3A1, 5.3A1, 9.3A1, 12.3A2** all deal with punctuation instructions unique to each chapter; the only instruction shared by all of these and **1.3A** is [1]: "Precede this area by a full stop, space, dash, space." All but 5.3A1 also have [2]: "For instruction on the use of spaces before and after prescribed punctuation, see 1.0C." I can't see any reason why the latter isn't in chapter 5?
- ✓ **11.3** refers to **3.3, 5.3** for punctuation, and to **12.3** for numbering

Recommendation A: add [2] to **5.3A1. Punctuation.**

Recommendation B: eliminate [1] from all but 1.3A and remove [2] also to 1.3A

Question: These instructions refer to punctuation for catalog cards, so when are these punctuation instructions going to be updated for online cataloging?

Instructions referring to other chapters' Area 3s:

- ✓ **3.3E1** refers to: Type and extent of resource (chapter 9)
- ✓ **3.3G1** refers to: numbering (chapter 12)
- ✓ **11.3A1, 11.3B1** and **11.3C1** refer each respectively to Cartographic materials (3.3), Music(5.3), and Serials (12.3) for microform versions of those types of materials

Discussion: Are there instances when other chapters should refer to other Area 3s? For example an electronic resource that is a serial and requires numbering; should not an instruction in 9.3X also refer the cataloger to 12.3X?

Potential problem: to be truly consistent would mean referring from many areas in a given chapter to areas in other chapters, with potential reciprocal links. Perhaps this isn't practical. Presently, common sense dictates while working, for example, on an electronic resource journal, one uses chapters 9 and 12, without having an apparent benefit of instructions to do so.

Possibilities:

- ✓ Refer from 9.3X to 12.3X (electronic serial)
- ✓ Refer from 5.3X to 12.3X (serially issued score publication [?])
- ✓ Refer from 5.3X to 9.3X (electronic score)
- ✓ Others, etc.
- ✓ Perhaps more practical: should there be a general instruction in 1.3, to refer to the relevant chapter(s) when dealing with mixed materials?

Recommendation: provide a general instruction in 1.3, to refer to relevant chapters when dealing with mixed materials. This would be provided for if, as recommended in this document in A), Unique rules in chapter 1, the text of 0.25 is moved to 1.3A.

Statement requiring the use of English

- ✓ **3.3A2** requires the use of English.
- ✓ No other rule (X.3) states this requirement, but **9.3** is always in English.
- ✓ **12.3, 5.3** indicate to transcribe as found in the piece or chief source.
- ✓ **11.3** depends on what type of material is being cataloged.

(1.0E1, *Language and script of the description*, states to follow instructions given in relevant rules of the chapters for Area 3, specific details area)

Recommendation A: add similar text of 3.3A2 to: 9.3 [any others?]

Discrepancy in rule numbering for 12.3A2 and 12.3A1:

In that 12.3A2 deals with punctuation and 12.3A1 deals with Applicability, whereas the other X.3A1 deal with punctuation.

Discussion: Is this part of the larger discussion on consistency in rule numbering? Or, why not reverse the content of these rules with each other so the numbering is at least consistent with the other chapters?