

TO: Kristin Lindlan, CC:DA Chair
FROM: Kathy Winzer, AALL Representative to CC:DA
SUBJECT: Revision and simplification of 12.1E1 [CC:DA/Schiff/2002/3]

As promised at the Jan. 27 meeting, I sent the proposed 12.1E revisions (*CC:DA/Schiff/2002/3*) to the law community, and few in the law community are in favor of the proposal as it stands now. Chapter 12 as a whole addresses the two formats separately, and we are not convinced that 12.1E1 needs to be an exception (see, for example 12.1B8, 12.1D3, 12.1E2 etc.)

Serials have been cataloged for years with the idea that most of the time the other title is not retained, and so specific guidelines for retention are important to indicate those occasions when it should be retained. For integrating resources, loose-leaves in particular, the other title is generally retained, and therefore specifying the exception, i.e. when it is not picked up, is appropriate. Most of the printed integrating resources are treatises, and as such the expectation for the other title is that it is retained. Rule 12.1E1 as it is currently written addresses the distinction between the two formats, and if retained would continue to do so.

If it is decided to change the rule so that it can be applied to both formats, the important instruction now in 12.1E1b must be included at the beginning of the rule. This suggestion was made by Judy Kuhagen after the CC:DA meeting.

In that case, 12.1E1 would start with the instruction: Transcribe other title information if considered to be important. In particular, transcribe or supply other title information if it falls within one of the categories below.

Moving this instruction to the beginning of the rule would require that some other areas be changed to avoid redundancy.

I would like to mention also that many of law catalogers would like the statement to be stronger, i.e. for integrating resources include any meaningful subtitle. The clear preference of most law catalogers who responded to my message is to retain the rule as it is currently written.

Kathy Winzer
Catalog Librarian
Robert Crown Law Library
Stanford University
Stanford, CA 94305-8612

e-mail: kwinzer@stanford.edu
phone: 650-723-0343 fax: 650-723-8657